



# City of Del Mar Staff Report



TO: Honorable Mayor and City Council Members

FROM: Kathleen A. Garcia, Planning and Community Development Director  
Via Scott W. Huth, City Manager

DATE: June 6, 2016

SUBJECT: Request to Approve Modifications (MOD16-002) to a Previously Approved Design Review Permit (DRB15-017) for Minor Design Changes to the City Hall/Town Hall/Plaza Project

## REQUESTED ACTION/RECOMMENDATION:

Review recommendations by the City Hall/Town Hall Project Subcommittee (Council Members Corti and Mosier), hear public testimony, and adopt Resolution 2016-XX (Attachment A) to approve MOD16-002 (Attachment B) to modify DRB15-017.

## EXECUTIVE SUMMARY:

This request is a modification (MOD16-002) to a previously-approved Design Review Permit (DRB15-017) (Attachment C) approved by the City Council on January 19, 2016 for the City Hall/Town Hall/Plaza Project (Project) by Resolution 2016-08 (Attachment D). The Modification request includes minor design changes to the project, including: various design revisions to the building façade, windows and doors, and west parking garage elevation; Town Hall roof material; landscaping, plaza layout and features; addition of antennas and catering kitchen exhaust; revisions to floor plans and parking garage layout (one-story garage proposed in lieu of two-story design); reduction from 160 to 140 parking stalls; addition of a new central stairwell and exterior stair near 10<sup>th</sup> Street for pedestrian garage access; removal of a patio, gate and fence; modification of a vehicle entry ramp on the south elevation; and addition of a vehicle access between the garage and surface parking lot on the internal west elevation.

## DISCUSSION/ANALYSIS:

On January 19, 2016, the City Council approved a package of entitlements for the Project as part of Resolution No. 2016-08 including DRB15-017, Coastal Development Permit (CDP15-010), Land Conservation Permit (LC15-008), and Tree Removal Permit

---

City Council Action:

(TRP15-014). Subsequent to that action, the project design team has shifted into the Construction Document (CD) phase. This phase involves the preparation of detailed structural and architectural plans in preparation for submittal to the Building Department for Building Code consistency review. As part of that process, the design team, with input from the Council Subcommittee, has noted design inefficiencies and conflicts requiring modifications prior to completing the CD plan sets. The design team and Council Subcommittee considered various options to address these issues and selected revisions for formal City Council review as MOD 16-002.

The following modifications are requested to the design plans approved by the City Council on January 19, 2016:

1. Garage – Eliminate Lower Level and Consolidate Parking on One Level:

The parking structure was previously considered as a two level structure with an internal access ramp (Attachment C, Sheet A101). During the course of the design refinement, a consolidation of parking was considered. On March 21, 2016, the City Council reviewed and agreed to move forward with a conceptual plan that eliminated the lower level (previous Level 2) of the parking structure and expanded Level One to also be under the Town Hall and Town Hall Commons (Attachment B, Sheet A101, A102). This reduced the overall parking quantity to approximately 140 stalls, and moved the 10<sup>th</sup> Street entry drive approximately 25 feet east of the previously approved 10<sup>th</sup> Street driveway. The project would continue to provide more parking (59 additional stalls) than otherwise required by the Zoning Code (81 required stalls).

2. Plaza Stairwells and Landscape - Modification based on Redesigned Garage:

The single level underground garage redesign prompted an opportunity for a new stairwell to adjoin the existing elevator shaft (Attachment B, Sheet A111) and a relocated exit door on the South Elevation (Attachment B, Sheet A102) Additionally, the Landscape Plan adjusted the location of the larger Holiday Tree and Monterey Cypress and other landscape (Attachment B, Sheet L301, L302) so that they either avoid the underground structure or are located on top of the garage column grid. The slight shift of tree location does not intrude into any of the EIR identified view corridors, nor does the stairwell protrude above the plaza level as a solid structure, therefore views remain unchanged but functionality and pedestrian connectivity is improved.

3. Roof – Material Change; Area for Additional Solar Panels:

As originally proposed the roof surface of Town Hall and City Hall was to be a combination of asphalt shingles and single-ply membrane, both in a light brown/warm grey color (Attachment C, Sheet A112). The Council Liaisons have recommended that the Town Hall roof be modified to be a standing seam metal roof in a similar “champagne” color (Attachment B, Sheet A112 and Materials

Board). The metal roof is more durable and upgraded, befitting the character of the Town Hall. Concern of glare will be alleviated by the matte finish and color. A narrow portion of the City Hall Roof (sloping east and adjoining Town Hall Commons) will also be converted to standing seam metal roof to match. The center portion of the City Hall is able to be raised by six inches to improve the structural design and maintain the profile under the height limit. Additionally, the area for solar panels has been expanded to also include the northern half of the City Hall roof rather than just the southern half.

4. Western Elevation of Parking Structure:

The western elevation of the Parking Structure was originally shown as having modular panels that provided noise and light attenuation. These panels were sculptural in nature, evoking an abstraction of the Del Mar bluffs (Attachment C, Sheet A200). However with the addition of a vehicular and pedestrian entry in the center of the west wall (as directed at the hearing of January 19, 2016), the modular panels were eliminated in favor of a solid concrete garage wall to provide the necessary noise and light attenuation. This garage wall will have varied treatments on the exterior, reflecting the site function (Attachment B, Sheet A200). At the northern most end of the western wall, the garage façade will be clad in wood slats to link to the trellis at the Ocean View Terrace above. In the center, the pedestrian door into the garage and elevator is highlighted by the addition of windows, making for a more inviting entry. The additional vehicular entry is provided in the center, as requested for the approval of DRB 15-017, and the trash enclosure is relocated adjacent to this vehicle drive aisle for both efficiencies and so as not to be opposite any adjoining residence. The southern portion of the garage façade maintains its screening with dense shrubs.

Along the northern portion of the surface parking lot adjacent to the western elevation of the parking structure, a pedestrian gate is included as required for emergency access. The parking lot gate is designed as a swing gate rather than a sliding gate for efficiencies.

5. Emergency Antennas and Kitchen Vent:

The City of Del Mar, County Sheriff and Del Mar's Community Emergency Response Team (CERT) operations require the six antennas and Wi-Fi currently located on the roof of the existing City Hall (Grey Room and Annex) to be relocated to the new facility for the continuation of operations, emergency response and service. Three of the small antennas would be used for the Fire and Sheriff Departments' communications and will be located at the northeast corner of the City Hall, opposite the elevator shaft. The three whip style antennas will be used for CERT purposes and are approximately ten feet tall (approximately 1 inch in diameter). The CERT antennas will be located on the Mechanical Room Exhaust Shaft adjacent to the trellis. They will be designed to telescope down when

not in use. Wi-Fi antennas will also be mounted at both locations. The antennas are shown in Attachment E.

The addition of the catering kitchen requires a kitchen exhaust vent to be located in the south east corner of the City Hall roof above the kitchen. The kitchen vent is required to be four feet in height above the roof and is located well above and downwind of surrounding residences.

6. Trellis and Safety Rail Refinement:

Trellis: The western most trellis at the edge of Ocean View Terrace was shown in illustrative sketches as having a “Torrey Pine Truss” style support system. The DRB 15-017 permit drawings for the Project show the trellis with simple “T” frame posts and beams. The Council Subcommittee has reviewed two options (Attachment F) for City Council discussion and direction:

- a. Option 1: Trellis with a “Torrey Pine Truss” style post/support system to uphold the trellis. This is a simpler of the two designs and has a more iconic “tree-like” structure. The canopy can be curvilinear to evoke a tree canopy. Due to cantilever, the trellis with this type of post is not able to extend over the pedestrian grand staircase.
- b. Option 2: Extended Trellis with double row of posts for a support system. Option 2 Trellis can extend over the staircase and, with a dual row of columns, create an outdoor “room” at the western edge of the Ocean View Terrace. The posts can also integrate into the façade of the garage, unifying the design elements and framing the view.

Both options are similar in cost but achieve different objectives. Staff is requesting that the City Council give the preferred direction to the architects for incorporation into the final drawings and into MOD16-002.

Safety Rail: The perimeter of the Ocean View Terrace, Town Hall Terrace (eliminated) and Town Hall Overlook contain a safety rail for pedestrian safety, originally designed as galvanized steel pipe railing. Based on recommendations from the Council subcommittee, the railing design has been modified to narrow, steel verticals with stainless steel cables (Attachment B2, Updated Materials Board). This offers a more refined look and is very transparent for views. At the west edge of the Ocean View Terrace and Town Hall Overlook, the top metal rail will be wood where it adjoins the plaza. The wood is ipe wood, a very durable hardwood in a deep brown that weathers to warm gray, and matches the wood finishes of the building.

7. Expansion Area B/Former Town Hall Terrace:

The City Council’s approval of DRB 15-017 eliminated the Town Hall Terrace at the south end of City Hall, at the site of Expansion Area B. This terrace is

modified to be a walkway to the City Hall south doors and a small paved area behind the mechanical exhaust shaft. Attachment B, Sheet L102 eliminates the gate and fence to correspond to the Terrace being eliminated. The remainder of the area (Expansion Area B) is landscaped until such time it is required for a future structure expansion (if needed). Note that a future structure expansion would be subject to separate entitlements and review as part of a public hearing process. Attachment B, Sheet L302 shows the new landscape for this rooftop area, creating a “green roof” at Expansion Area B.

8. Modifications to Building Elevations:

To match the City Hall operations inside, the modified design changes certain windows on the façades of City Hall (Attachment B, East and South Elevations, Sheet A201) and Town Hall (Attachment B, North and South Elevations, Sheet A202). MOD16-002 relocates the kitchen door on the south façade west by approximately 15 feet and substituted a double door for a roll-up door. (Attachment B, South Elevation, Sheet A202). The Town Hall and Breezeway façades and doors were modified to provide a covered pedestrian route to the restrooms and for better breezeway functionality and emergency egress requirements (Attachment B, Sheet 202). Modified Building Elevations and Sections can be found in Attachment B, Sheets A200, A201, A202, A300, A301, A302, and A303.

9. Modifications to Electrical Site Plan:

The approval of DRB15-017 requested a substitution of the lighting bollard. MOD16-002 includes a new metal bollard (Attachment B2, Materials Board) that meets the requirement of <3,000 Kelvins and is in keeping with the materials palette of the other site furnishings. The parking lot wall lighting scone has been substituted with a fixture that is dimmable for operational requirements to meet the permit conditions, while maintaining the low level, downward focused light.

Construction Cost Implications: The above modifications have been incorporated into the latest estimate of construction costs and can be achieved within the \$12,590,039 construction budget. However, the savings assumed to be generated from the single level garage was utilized by the higher grade materials in the trellis, Town Hall metal roof and stainless steel/wood railing as well as the addition of the pedestrian stairwell from the garage, creation of a ‘green roof’ at the former Town Hall Terrace, and the additional planting, vehicle access and gates stipulated in DRB15-017 permit.

PROJECT'S CONSISTENCY WITH THE DESIGN REVIEW ORDINANCE:

As of the writing of this report, the Planning Department has not received any correspondence regarding the proposed modification requests to DRB15-017. Planning staff has reviewed the proposed project modifications to evaluate their consistency with the Design Review Ordinance (DRO), particularly with regard to the issues considered at the January 19, 2016 City Council meeting regarding neighbor privacy, traffic/parking/pedestrian circulation, lighting, and noise. Based on staff's review of the modifications, the application request appears to be consistent with the applicable provisions of the DRO and would not appear to cause adverse impacts with the issues cited above.

RECOMMENDATION:

Staff requests that City Council provide direction on Trellis Option 1 and Option 2 (Attachment F) for incorporation into MOD16-002 and the subsequent architectural drawings. Staff recommends that the City Council adopt the Resolution (Attachment A), approve modification application MOD16-002, a request to modify the approved DRB project plans and materials board for DRB15-017. Staff also recommends that the following conditions be attached to any approval of the subject application.

*The gaps in the numbering and lettering of the conditions are intentional.*

General Conditions

G-3 *[Development Authorization Limited to Plan Set]*

This modification is granted based on revised plans dated **June 6, 2016** and so identified by the staff of the Del Mar Planning Department. Revisions to these plans and/or any proposals for modification of the building footprint(s) or envelope shall require review and prior authorization from the appropriate entities of the City of Del Mar.

G-19 *[Compliance with Previous Conditions]*

In accordance with the DMMC, implementation of MOD16-002 shall be subject to compliance with all terms and conditions required by DRB15-017, as listed in Council Resolution No. 2016-08 and approved by the City Council on January 19, 2016.

FISCAL IMPACT:

The City Hall project efforts to date are funded in the adopted FY 2015 - 2016 and 2016 – 2017 Operating and Capital Budget.

ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT:

The proposed Modification (MOD16-002) is found to be consistent with the Final Environmental Impact Report (EIR) and Mitigation Monitoring and Reporting Program (MMRP) that were prepared and certified pursuant to the provisions of California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) on January 4, 2016.

ATTACHMENTS:

Attachment A – Proposed Resolution  
Attachment B – MOD16-002 Permit Drawings Annotated/Materials Board  
Attachment C – Previously-approved Design Review Permit Drawings, DRB15-017  
Attachment D – Resolution No. 2016-08 (DRB Permit 15-017)  
Attachment E – CERT, Emergency Responders and Wi-Fi Antennas  
Attachment F – Ocean View Terrace Trellis Options

**\*\*Due to the large size of the attachments listed above, please go to [www.delmar.ca.us/cityhall](http://www.delmar.ca.us/cityhall) to view these documents. Click on the link entitled “Attachments to Item 9 – June 6, 2016 City Council Meeting”, which is located on the right-hand side of the webpage\*\***