



City of Del Mar Staff Report



TO: Honorable Mayor and City Council Members

FROM: Kathleen A. Garcia, Planning and Community Development Director
Via Scott W. Huth, City Manager

DATE: May 5, 2014

SUBJECT: City Hall and Town Hall Space Program Recommendation

REQUESTED ACTION/RECOMMENDATION:

Staff requests that the City Council review and provide direction on the recommended City Hall, Town Hall, Parking and Plaza Programs for use in subsequent cost analysis and land use options.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY:

On April 21, 2014, the City Council discussed the architectural consultants' opinions of the space program for a new City Hall and Town Hall. The recommended space needs varied between 8,395 and 10,837 gross square feet (GSF) for the City Hall facility and between 4,313 and 5,046 GSF for a Town Hall with community meeting rooms and Council Chamber. Staff has now readdressed both programs and is recommending areas where space savings could be achieved and outlining choices for City Council decisions.

DISCUSSION/ANALYSIS:

During the April 21, 2014 City Council meeting, the Council reviewed the current facilities used by City Hall functions (8,086 GSF) and the space requirement recommendations by Carrier Johnson Architects for a new City Hall (10,837 GSF) and Town Hall (5,046 GSF). The City Council also heard a second opinion from Leeger Architecture who recommended a replacement City Hall of 8,395 GSF and a Town Hall of 4,313 GSF. The primary differences between the two opinions of the City Hall program included different circulation allowances: 20-33% (2,150 SF) vs. 15% (1,095 SF); different sizes of the indoor public space for the counter, public information area, and reception: 810 SF vs. 450 SF; and different allocations of storage: 1,620 GSF vs. 1,322 GSF.

City Hall Analysis:

Circulation Allowances: The circulation allowance is defined as the area used for hallways, corridors, vestibules, partitions or wall thicknesses. It varies from project to project, depending on building design, structural spans and column design. According

City Council Action:

to the textbook, Space Planning Basics¹, any factor is an “educated guess” at the future organization of the building. The textbook also identifies that an underestimation will limit adjacencies and flexibility of the space during design.

The circulation allowance varied significantly from the two estimates, from a low of 15% to a high of 33% which results in a square foot difference of approximately 1,000 SF between the two opinions. As a third opinion, Space Planning Basics recommends a circulation allowance between 25% and 33% of the total square feet at early planning stages.

Staff has reconfirmed the circulation allowance with Carrier Johnson, the architect contracted for the space plan. They reinforce the need to maintain a 33% factor (for offices) and a 20% factor (for support and conference areas) for this phase of early planning, since it is prior to any design work. When the building organization and program adjacencies are determined in Schematic Design, they estimate that this circulation allowance could drop lower, but that it is too early in the process to be restricted to a lower factor. Attachment A provides additional background on determining the circulation factor.

City Hall Considerations for Program Refinements: From the two architectural firms’ opinions of space needs, staff reviewed the assumptions by department, including assessing options for shared use and efficiencies and is proposing a space program for planning purposes. A summary of the program and options for consideration, in tabular form, is provided in Attachment B. It is assumed that this program will be further refined during the design stages of any new building to further explore efficiencies and reductions. (Note: The reductions listed below are reductions when compared to the Carrier Johnson program.)

- Storage: Staff has reassessed the City Hall storage requirements by department (including Emergency Operations Center storage) and recognizes that a new facility will allow for more shared file and project storage that is not available in the current facility. This could reduce the storage requirements from 1,620 GSF to 1,200 GSF (1,000 net SF).
- Assume a shared Finance and Planning Counter which could have efficiencies to reduce the program by approximately 50 SF.
- Eliminate the records clerk desk, assuming a part-time records clerk and intern could share the same space, reducing the program by approximately 100 SF.
- Reduce the lunch room from 200 SF to 150 SF, reducing the program by 50 SF.
- Make all space for contract employees/future departments as an option.

The reduction in the amount of City Hall storage, support space and contract offices would reduce the overall building program to 9,464 GSF for the City Hall. This

¹ Space Planning Basics by Mark Karlen (John Wiley & Sons, Hoboken NJ, 2009)

maintains the conservative factor for circulation (33%) at this early stage and recognizes that subsequent design may reduce that factor significantly. This program is entitled "Municipal Building Minimum" in Attachment B.

During prior program discussions, a number of additional space needs have been identified, which are expressed as options in Attachment B.

The options to consider include:

- Include two Council/Contract staff offices adding to the program by approximately 333 SF (Option A, Attachment B).
- Include an area for a Sheriff's desk, adding approximately 50 SF (Option A, Attachment B).
- Include an allowance for a future Building Department, eliminating the need for customers to go to Solana Beach, which would add approximately 612 SF to the program (Option B, Attachment B).
- Include an allowance for future staff or departments not currently envisioned (950 SF) (Option C, Attachment B).

If the considered options were selected, the minimum City Hall program would increase to between 9,814 SF and 11,454 SF.

Town Hall Analysis:

During the 1990 Del Mar Community Center Master Plan, the Town Hall was envisioned to be a 3,690 SF Council Chamber with a capacity for 100 participants. When it was not being used for City Council, Planning Commission and Design Review Board meetings, it was envisioned to "be available for various public uses including meetings, performances, exhibits and others."² At that time, the Del Mar TV station was planned to renovate and expand its existing building by a 400 SF addition. During the development of the schematic design by Architects Robert A.M. Stern and Jim Kelley-Markham in June 1991, the Town Meeting Hall included a small lobby, a 150-person meeting hall, a 20-person conference room, janitor storage and restrooms for an area of 4,309 GSF. No provisions were provided for a television station in the Town Hall.

In the 2014 Town Hall program architect's opinions, the Town Hall was estimated between 4,313 and 5,046 GSF and included a large multipurpose community meeting room to serve as a Council Chamber as well as meeting rooms for a total of 175-person meeting space(s). The major differences between the two programs were the inclusion or exclusion of restrooms for the Town Hall (0 SF vs. 600 SF); the provision of janitor/storage space (0 SF vs. 145 SF) and the size of the Del Mar TV facility (500 SF vs. 600 SF). The areas to accommodate 175-person seating in flexible meeting spaces were somewhat similar when the circulation was factored in (3,192 GSF vs. 3,450 GSF)

² Del Mar Community Center Master Plan, July 1990, Kaplan/McLaughlin/Diaz Planning and Design

and could account for the differences in storage and Del Mar TV provisions in the two programs.

Council Chamber/Meeting Rooms: The current Council Chamber accommodates approximately 50 people, including the City Council and staff at the dais. While this size is adequate for lightly attended public meetings, it often fills to capacity (estimated at 50% of the time) and is sometimes too small for the audience, when additional people are waiting in the lobby or standing in the back of the room (estimated at 10% of the time). Large City Council and Design Review Board meetings have brought 75 to 100 people to the meeting. Likewise, when arranged in a workshop format, the current Council Chamber is stretched to accommodate more than 50 to 60 people. In the workshops conducted between 2011 and 2013, participants have numbered between 60 and 80 people. Both architect's programs recommended a multipurpose room that would accommodate up to 175 people and be sub dividable into smaller rooms to fit 25, 50 and 100 people and serve a multiplicity of functions, including Council Chamber and TV studio. The smaller meeting rooms could serve for Closed Session, committee and community meeting spaces.

In addition to meetings, these multipurpose meeting rooms could also serve as a multi-function space for lectures, small concerts, art venues, or other programs not currently offered by the City of Del Mar. A meeting room(s) could also be able to be used as a television studio by Del Mar TV.

Restrooms: It is recommended that public restrooms be included in the Town Hall, as the Town Hall may be a separate structure from City Hall, may be open to the public when City Hall is closed, and may be utilized for other events, such as community functions. The requirements for a 175-person assembly space would necessitate approximately 720 SF of Town Hall public restrooms.

Del Mar TV: Currently, in the existing 2,636 GSF Communications Center building, Del Mar TV utilizes approximately 600-720 SF of the facility for control rooms, editing, offices, and storage in addition to the 835 SF TV Studio, which is also the Council Chamber. The City currently contracts with the Del Mar Television Foundation to operate, broadcast, and provide production services for the Del Mar TV Studio. Through the City's agreement, the Foundation is required to operate the TV studio and produce government, educational, and community programming, as well as provide training opportunities. In addition, the Foundation provides a crew to produce, and broadcast approximately 50 government meetings per year. In addition to an annual contractual payment, the City provides TV studio facilities, including rent, utilities and maintenance to the Foundation at no cost.

Staff is currently discussing space needs with Del Mar TV and has identified a range of options in Attachment B. The minimum space necessary for control room operations in order to broadcast public meetings is approximately 240 SF. If Del Mar TV offices,

editing and studio support space were also included, those space needs would increase to approximately 600 to 720 SF.

Town Hall Considerations: The minimum necessary for the Town Hall's municipal meetings (City Council, Planning Commission, Design Review Board, etc.) as well as shared staff conference room/Closed Session meeting room is a 75-seat facility. When coupled with the necessary support space, restrooms and a TV control room, the minimum size necessary for municipal functions is estimated to be 2,316 GSF (Attachment B, Town Hall).

To consider additional space for larger workshops, meetings, community meeting rooms and civic event function space in the Town Hall, or to include Del Mar TV office space, the Council may wish to consider options.

- Option A, to add 600 SF to the Town Hall to provide the Del Mar TV space that is equivalent to their existing offices and control room space.
- Option B, to include meeting rooms for 125 people and correspondingly sized restrooms.
- Option C, to include meeting rooms for up to 175 people and correspondingly sized restrooms.
- If this Town Hall is to serve as a community center, the City Council may also wish to consider a small caterer's kitchen such as at the Powerhouse. An additional 200 SF is shown in the support space in Attachment B, Town Hall Option C. (By comparison, the Powerhouse can accommodate 120 persons, using both inside and outdoor tables and has a small, prep kitchen of approximately 200 SF).

These additional options could increase the Town Hall program to be between 2,694 GSF and 5,256 GSF.

Plaza Space:

A civic plaza is often the center for community activities and is designed as an extension of a building lobby, inviting users for active and passive events. In many cities, a civic plaza is a vital component to a downtown. In addition to seating and gathering, a civic plaza can also provide areas for storm water management, bicycle racks, an amphitheater or urban park space. During the December 2, 2013 Community Workshop and the subsequent survey, many expressed a desire to have a plaza space for outdoor gathering as part of the Civic Center. In addition, many also requested that the existing Farmer's Market be maintained at the City Hall site. Options are shown in Attachment B, Plaza.

The City Hall alone would function with an entry court of approximately 2,500 SF (approximately 50 feet x 50 feet) that could serve as a forecourt, or small event space accommodating about 50 standing people. This size is approximately the size of the plaza/green amphitheater space at the corner of 15th Street and Camino del Mar.

A small size plaza of approximately 5,000 SF (approximately 70 feet x 70 feet could accommodate a gathering of about 100 people (Option A).

A medium-sized plaza, one that was equal to the building size would be approximately 10,000 SF (100 feet by 100 feet). It could be designed in many configurations and accommodate over 200 people standing or seated (Option B).

The Del Mar Farmer's Market currently occupies approximately 15,000 SF in the lower parking lot of City Hall. A large plaza of 15,000 SF could accommodate 300 or more people for special events, festivals, outdoor art shows or the Farmer's Market (Option C).

Parking:

Pursuant to the Del Mar Municipal Code (DMMC), the required parking for a 9,464 SF City Hall office building (32 parking stalls) and a 75-seat Town Hall with Del Mar TV control room (16 parking stalls) totals 48 parking stalls, which would be the minimum required for the site.

In addition to the required parking, the 1050 Camino del Mar site could physically accommodate additional parking, whether it be used for supplemental downtown parking, employee parking or parking for other on-site uses.

Parking on a single level over half the site would accommodate approximately 75 cars (either in a garage or on surface parking). If the entire site was parked in a single level garage under buildings, it would have space for approximately 150 cars. If a multilevel garage was constructed, parking capacity could be increased to 200 to 250 cars.

Options are shown in Attachment B, Parking.

- Option A provides for additional municipal parking for Del Mar TV full offices (51 cars) and 50 cars for additional public parking.
- Option B provides for additional municipal parking for a 125-seat Town Hall (62 cars) and an additional 75 public parking stalls.
- Option C provides for additional municipal parking for a 175-seat Town Hall (75 cars) and an additional 100 public parking stalls.
- Option D maximizes the public parking with an additional 125 stalls for a total parking count of approximately 200 stalls.

Summary:

From the recommendations of the two consultants, staff has derived a draft program (Attachment B) with the core requirements (municipal building minimum) as well as options identified. The City Council is requested to provide confirmation of the core planning program as well as direction on the options for consideration in future planning and cost estimating.

FISCAL IMPACT:

The Program Verification contract of \$3,000 was allocated in the City Hall consultant services in FY 2013-2014 Capital and Operating Budget. Future capital improvement projects would require funding in future budgets.

ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT:

In accordance with CEQA standards, facility planning is not defined as a project and is therefore exempt from the provisions of CEQA.

PRIOR CITY COUNCIL REVIEW:

During the April 21, 2014 meeting, the City Council heard the opinion of Carrier Johnson Architects on the preliminary space needs for planning future facilities and a second opinion from Leeger Architects.

ATTACHMENTS:

Attachment A – Carrier Johnson Architects’ Circulation Allowance Determination
Attachment B – Tabular summary of Recommended Program and Options

Attachment A

Determining Circulation Allowance

The square footage is confirmed again once the Test Fits are developed (initiating schematic design). That is when the usable area and the circulation factor are confirmed.

1.-the Usable Square feet (USF) as listed in the Program draft, is exclusively the actual area that an end-user will occupy to perform his/ her assigned tasks.

2.- The Circulation Factor is made up of **ALL** the following building elements, which at the time the Program is developed, is a big unknown number.

- The actual circulation space required by code to allow end-users to maneuver between offices and cubicles and all other rooms.

- The interior wall thickness between each space

- The work station cubicle thickness

- vertical circulation space such as interconnecting stairs and elevators.

- mechanical, electrical, plumbing and all other conduit shafts.

All of the items listed under item 2 are difficult to forecast at the time the Program is defined, and therefore the industry standard is to forecast on a higher side for planning safety. At this point, the estimate is on the conservative side. But once the Space Plan is developed, we find a reasonable circulation factor that varies as follows:

Scenario A: The entire Program space is planned on a single floor; therefore there are no vertical shafts for stairs or elevator. The Circulation factor can be reduced from 33% to between 20 – 24%

Scenario B: The Program space is planned on at least 2 stacked floors; therefore there will be vertical shafts for stairs and elevator, plus utility shafts. The Circulation Factor will be reduced from 33% to between 24-28%. In addition, we still need to include the exterior wall thickness at the end of the calculations to determine the Gross Square Feet.

This is the range that our experience has taught us after working on several million square feet of office space, and multiple civic and municipal projects.

ernesto santos | principal - interiors | leed ap id+c

carrier johnson + **CULTURE**

1301 third avenue, san diego ca 92101
phone 619-239-2353 / 619-687-2440 direct
cell 619-517-5679
fax 619-239-6227

architecture for urban environments

www.carrierjohnson.com

Attachment B: Program + Options

	Existing (includes Annex/Trailer)	Municipal Building Minimum	Option A Add Contract Services/ Council Offices	Option B Add Building Department	Option C Add Reserve for Future Departments	Carrier Johnson Recommended Program
City Hall						
City Hall (City Administration Offices)			<i>includes Minimum + Option A</i>	<i>includes Minimums + Option A+B</i>	<i>includes Minimum + Options A+B+C</i>	
Public Reception & Counter	278	710				810
City Manager's Office	707	955				985
Adminstrative Services	848	1,118				1,371
Planning	735	1,307				1,427
Finance Department	993	985				985
Ranger/Sheriff	180	180	50			353
Council/Contract Services (2 offices)	106	-	333			333
Building Department	-	-		612		
Allowance for future Department	-	-			950	
Common Areas/Support/Restrooms	3,854	3,760				4,060
Total Usable Square Feet	7,701	9,013	9,346	9,958	10,908	10,324
Total Gross Square Feet (+5%)	8,086	9,464	9,814	10,456	11,454	10,840

*All area calculations in square feet and include circulation factor of 20%-33%.
It is anticipated that additional efficiencies could be realized during the design phase.*

Town Hall	Existing TV Studio/ Chambers*	Municipal Building Minimum (75 seat Town Hall)	Option A Add Del Mar TV offices	Option B Town Hall Seating for 125	Option C Town Hall Seating for 175	Carrier Johnson Recommended Program
Town Hall			<i>includes Minimum + Option A</i>	<i>includes Minimums + Option A+B</i>	<i>includes Minimum + Options A+B+C</i>	
25-person meeting room	450	450	450	450	450	450
50-person meeting room	835	942	942	1,884	942	942
100-person meeting room		-	-	-	1,800	1,800
Storage/Support	295	174	174	174	374	174
Restrooms	185	400	400	500	720	720
Del Mar TV	600	240	600	600	720	720
Total Usable Square Feet:	2,365	2,206	2,566	3,608	5,006	4,806
Total Gross Square Feet (+5%):	2,636	2,316	2,694	3,788	5,256	5,046

all figures shown in square feet (SF)

circulation factor for new space is 20%. It is anticipated that additional efficiencies could be realized during design phase.

**circulation factor for existing space is +/-11.5%, existing conference room only seats 15, studio seats 50.*

Plaza	Municipal Building Minimum	Option A	Option B	Option C
Plaza (square feet size)				
A. Entry court, 50-person plaza	2,500			
B. Small plaza, 100-person		5,000		
C. Medium plaza, 200-person			10,000	
D. Large plaza, Farmers Market, 300-person				15,000
<i>all figures shown in square feet (SF)</i>				

Parking	Existing Parking 1050 CDM	Minimum Municipal Buildings	Option A 50 public stalls	Option B 75 public stalls	Option C 100 public stalls	Option D 125 public stalls
Municipal Parking per DMMC						
City Hall at 1:300		32	33	35	38	37
Town Hall at 1:5 seats + DMTV (2)		16	18	27	37	37
		48	51	62	75	74
Additional Public Parking		0	50	75	100	125
Total Parking	58	48	101	137	175	199

all figures shown in square feet (SF)

Required parking shown per Del Mar Municipal Code (DMMC) standards for office and public assembly

City Hall and Town Hall municipal parking options match City Hall/Town Hall expansion options