



**MINUTES
SEA-LEVEL RISE STAKEHOLDER-TECHNICAL
ADVISORY COMMITTEE (STAC)
CITY OF DEL MAR**

Civility Works: The Del Mar Code of Civil Discourse:

Together we will promote inclusion; listen to understand; show respect; be clear and fair; and focus on the issue.

**DEL MAR (TEMPORARY) CITY HALL
2010 JIMMY DURANTE BOULEVARD, SUITE 220*, DEL MAR 92014
THURSDAY, September 29, 2016 – 4:00 PM
City Council Liaisons: Don Mosier, Dwight Worden**

COMMITTEE'S STATEMENT OF MISSION/PURPOSE:

Oversee the Sea-Level Rise Local Coastal Program Amendment process to make sure that the process is open, inclusive and develops consensus amongst the many stakeholders; to assist City staff and the consultant with the sea-level rise planning process; to assist in the review of technical studies and sea-level rise planning scenarios; to assist the community in prioritizing vulnerable coastal resources; to discuss and provide advice and policy recommendations to the Del Mar City Council; and to provide input to the Del Mar City Council on the Local Coastal Program Amendment process. (Ref. City Council Resolution 2015-10)

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Anyone may address the Committee for three minutes on any items listed on the agenda. If there are several speakers on an item, your time available to speak may be limited to two minutes. When the Committee Chairperson recognizes you, please step forward and state your name and address of residence clearly for the record. The Committee may ask questions of you, to which you may respond.

For items not on the agenda, please see: *Oral Communications*.

1. CALL TO ORDER (4:05 PM)

2. ROLL CALL

All STAC members were present except for Kim Fletcher and Sarah Giddings. Councilmembers Don Mosier and Dwight Worden were present. Kathy Garcia and Amanda Lee from the Planning Department and Nick Garrity of ESA were present.

3. APPROVAL OF MINUTES (July 21, 2016)

Brinner made a motion to approve the minutes with a correction on item 7, point 4 "Public Comment" to clarify that she objected to the beach loss statement made by Mr. Peeler during public comment as inaccurate since the natural bluffs will retreat if the ocean meets the bluff, thus creating more beach. Crabtree seconded the motion and the July 21, 2016 Meeting Minutes were approved unanimously as corrected.

4. CITY COUNCIL LIAISON COMMENTS

Mosier commented that during the Coastal Clean Up day, he had the opportunity to observe the Fish & Wildlife basin in the San Dieguito River, which is opposite Crest Canyon. He observed that the tidal flow had improved significantly which was positive for the lagoon.

5. COMMITTEE MEMBER AND STAFF UPDATES

Garcia introduced Senior Planner Amanda Lee to the project team.

Garcia indicated that Del Mar was the recipient of the Round 3 Grant Program Award for the preparation of supplemental analysis of sea-level rise and river flooding scenarios, preparation of a Sediment Management Plan, preparation of a Lagoon Wetland Habitat Migration Assessment, and supplemental community and stakeholder outreach. The STAC could be reconvened for this work program in 2017 and 2018.

Fuller indicated that Phase 2 of the South Lot Lagoon Restoration Project was underway on the 22nd DAA property.

Bekkar stated that he had been invited to participate on a committee to study natural adaptation measures to Sea Level Rise (SLR).

Buhr stated that the San Diego Climate Collaborative had been awarded a grant to fill in the gaps of city's Adaptation Plans, particularly economic analyses and legal aspects. There will be a November workshop by the Climate Collaborative that will present SLR case studies.

Gaasterland asked how bluff failures may be monitored and if there was any estimate of the volumes of slippage from some of the latest bluff failures. Staff did not know of any formal monitoring. Handzel remarked that NCTD has sensors along the tracks to monitor vibration or movement.

Bekkar introduced "Blue Tribe" a software company that provides data recording that may be of interest for monitoring SLR.

6. ORAL COMMUNICATIONS FROM THE PUBLIC (NON-ACTION ITEMS)

State law precludes the Committee from acting on any topic which is not an action item on the posted agenda. Your information may be received, placed on the next agenda, or referred to the Committee Chairperson.

Three members of the community were present: Charlie Gaylord, Ocean Front; Sarah Faurot of LSA; and David Grueb. Charlie Gaylord asked how the community can comment on the draft plans posted on the website. Garcia indicated that she would be happy to receive written comments and will update the website to identify how to submit comments.

7. REVIEW OF DRAFT ADAPATION PLAN (TASK 3.1) AND FINAL RECOMMENDATIONS FOR ADAPTATION STRATEGIES RELATED TO BEACH EROSION, BLUFF EROSION, AND RIVER FLOODING [ESA]

Garrity continued the discussion on adaptation planning from the Committee's July 21, 2016 meetings and obtained further input for consideration in the Plan. The following summarizes key points made as part of Garrity's presentation, Committee feedback, public input and **consensus and formal motions made by the Committee (in bold)**.

Garrity reviewed the guiding principles for the Draft Adaptation Plan to receive comments from STAC.

1. "Limit the risk of extreme coastal and river flooding and damage to less than approximately a 5% chance of occurring in a given year (i.e., 5% annual-chance of occurrence):" Concern by Gaylord that none of the principles addressed private property or the protection of existing homes. Crabtree identified Principle 1 as the appropriate location. Worden suggested that the title of the principle be reworded to say: "Limit Flood Risk to Public and Private Properties and Environmental Resources." It was also suggested that the specific detail be moved to another section to keep the strength of the principles.
**Motion by Crabtree, seconded by Gaasterland to reword Principle 1 to say: "Limit Flood Risk to Public and Private Properties and Environmental Resources".
Motion passed 6-0-1 (Buhr abstained).**
2. "Maintain a walkable beach for as long as possible for recreational use, economic benefit, and to reduce flooding:" Concern of wording "as long as possible" in that it did not give adequate protection for the beach.
Motion by Gaasterland, seconded by Brinner to delete "as long as possible" from Principle 2. Motion passed 6-0-1 (Buhr abstained).
3. "Maintain continuous horizontal coastal access and vertical water access points to North and South Beach:" No comments on Principle 3.
4. "Maintain San Dieguito Lagoon wetland habitat functions:" Fuller questioned who was responsible for implementation and financing of maintaining lagoon, given all the parties involved. **It was suggested that the examples of projects be moved to another section and coordination with regional restoration efforts should be added.**

Bekkar suggested a fifth guiding principle to address mitigations for climate change and greenhouse gas emissions and to create a nexus to the Del Mar Climate Action Plan (CAP). Garrity suggested three options: a) add another Guiding Principle; b) expand description of Climate Action Plan in Section 2 that would provide more on the connection between the CAP and the Adaptation Plan; or c) create a new section in the Adaptation Plan to discuss. **The majority of the STAC felt that b) was the appropriate direction.** Garrity will add the discussion and review with the Subcommittee.

The STAC discussed whether or not it was necessary to prioritize the Guiding Principles. **STAC determined that all are a priority and are not in rank order, which will be noted.**

Garrity reviewed the proposed Beach Adaptation Measures in the Adaptation Plan:

- a) Beach and dune nourishment: **Direction was to identify the concern with the impacts to surf, views, and windblown sand and that any nourishment needed**

monitoring.

- b) Raise/improve sea walls and revetments
- c) Sand retention structures: **Direction was to remove breakwaters to “considered but not recommended, keep groins but identify as a lower priority because of the potential impacts requiring mitigation, to maintain reefs and add “new technologies” to accommodate future appropriate structures.**
- d) Raise structures
- e) Remove structures

Garrity reviewed the Beach Adaptation Triggers. **Buhr requested that the baseline for the dates be added.**

Garrity reviewed the Beach Adaptation Plan Framework. There was confusion as to how the estimated lead times in years was presented in the chart. There was also differences of opinions on the scenarios shown, in that Scenario 1B could have beach loss and would go against the Principle to preserve the beach. There were discussions of adding a new scenario or adjusting the scenarios to show earlier removal of structures so as to preserve the beach.

Public Comment: Gaylord identified that this had immediate implementation impacts, such as should basements be allowed along the beach?

Motion by Crabtree, Second by Bekkar to make the following changes to the Beach Adaptation Measures, Triggers, Framework and Scenarios

- **Identify the concern with the impacts to surf, views, and windblown sand and that any nourishment needed monitoring.**
- **Remove breakwaters to “considered but not recommended, keep groins but identify as a lower priority because of the potential impacts requiring mitigation, maintain reefs and add “new technologies” to accommodate future appropriate structures.**
- **Add baseline year for the Beach Adaptation Triggers.**
- **Modify Figure 20 (Beach Adaptation Plan Framework) to describe the lead time as a planning horizon in the titles but not in the band.**
- **Describe the consequences associated with each scenario, their consistency with the guiding Principles and how scenarios are examples and not necessarily recommendations.**

Motion passed 6-0-1 (Buhr abstained).

8. ITEMS FOR NEXT AGENDA

This is the **final** STAC meeting for the current work plan. The STAC subcommittee will provide feedback to staff and the City’s technical consultant during the development of the draft adaptation plan and policy recommendations, after input from the California Coastal Commission.

Public hearings on the draft amendments with the City's Planning Commission and City Council are scheduled for the first quarter of 2017, with a final submittal of the City's LCP Amendment to the Coastal Commission by May 2017.

The STAC may be reconvened for the Round 3 Grant program, tentatively scheduled for 2017-2018.

9. ADJOURNMENT

Motion to adjourn: Unanimous 7-0. Meeting adjourned at 6:03 PM