



**MINUTES
SEA-LEVEL RISE STAKEHOLDER-TECHNICAL
ADVISORY COMMITTEE (STAC)
CITY OF DEL MAR**

**DEL MAR (TEMPORARY) CITY HALL, COUNCIL CHAMBERS
2010 JIMMY DURANTE BOULEVARD, SUITE 100, DEL MAR 92014
THURSDAY, JANUARY 25, 2018 – 4:00 PM
City Council Liaisons: David Druker, Dwight Worden**

COMMITTEE'S STATEMENT OF MISSION/PURPOSE:

Oversee the Sea-Level Rise Local Coastal Program Amendment process to make sure that the process is open, inclusive and develops consensus amongst the many stakeholders; to assist City staff and the consultant with the sea-level rise planning process; to assist in the review of technical studies and sea-level rise planning scenarios; to assist the community in prioritizing vulnerable coastal resources; to discuss and provide advice and policy recommendations to the Del Mar City Council; and to provide input to the Del Mar City Council on the Local Coastal Program Amendment process. (Ref. City Council Resolution 2015-10)

1. CALL TO ORDER

2. ROLL CALL *Meeting start time 4:04 p.m.*

- *STAC Attending: Chair Terry Gaasterland, John Imperato, Charles Fletcher, Mark Handzel, Robin Crabtree, Nancy Stoke, Dustin Fuller, and Kristin Brinner*
- *STAC Absent: Sarah Giddings and Gabriel Buhr*
- *City Council Liaisons Attending: Dwight Worden; Dave Druker*
- *Staff: Kathy Garcia, Amanda Lee, Adriana Jaramishian*

3. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Prior to the vote approving the minutes, Brinner raised a concern about votes taken by the advisory committee on December 7, 2017, and stated she believes several STAC members have a conflict of interest that should disqualify them from participating on certain votes due to financial interest. The Meeting Minutes for December 7, 2017 were subsequently approved by STAC with the understanding that the potential "conflict of interest" concern would be raised to the attention of the City Attorney. Motion Gaasterland, second Imperato. Motion passed by vote 7-1 with Handzel voting no. [City Attorney will advise.]

4. RECOMMENDATION TO CITY COUNCIL ON DRAFT ADAPTATION PLAN

Presentation by Chair Gaasterland on behalf of Subcommittee identifying changes made to the draft per STAC's action at the December 7 meeting and additional minor corrections for STAC to weigh in on. Red dot correspondence from the Beach Preservation Coalition (cover letter, ~~strikeout underline~~ of STAC subcommittee's draft memo on managed retreat, and Walt Crampton white paper) is posted on the web page.

The following speakers provided comments:

Sheree Wade (speaking for Diana Lynch, Ocean Front)

Walt Crampton (received time donation from Joy Buca, Sherri Hayward)

*Jon Corn (received time donation from Heather Lindsey, Lucille Lindsey)
Tina Thomas*

After STAC member questions and discussion on Item 4, STAC took the following actions:

1) Motion Handzel, second Crabtree. **Keep option for armoring bluffs at Powerhouse Park in Adaptation Plan (AP) Section 8.1.4. Vote passed 7-1 (Brinner voting no).**

2) Motion Crabtree, second Handzel. **Keep the statement in AP Section 4.6 second paragraph: "After much discussion, STAC determined that it is too early in the process to include managed retreat as an adaptation option for Del Mar." Vote passed 7-0-1 (Imperato abstained).**

Consideration of whether to include a definition of walkable beach will be deferred to future sediment management plan discussions. No vote was taken. Text will be left as is.

Submerged reefs was not added as a specific type of adaptation option. Text will be left as is.

3) Motion Handzel, second Crabtree. **Add introductory text to AP Chapter 3 (as read in record by Chair Gaasterland) to explain why the information was included in the AP. Vote passed 8-0.**

STAC Member Stoke wants the AP document to identify the STAC membership. No vote taken.

Motion Gaasterland, second Imperato. Keep the managed retreat summary as a memo, return it to the Subcommittee to refine and polish, and incorporate red dot correspondence input.

Motion withdrawn to allow STAC to continue with discussion to address and finalize the memo.

4) Motion Gaasterland, second Imperato. **Delete notes listed at the end of Memo Section 10.6. Vote passed 8-0.**

5) Motion Handzel, second Crabtree. **List in alphabetical order the individual STAC member written statements on managed retreat in the memo. Ask the City Attorney if a descriptor (i.e. beach resident, bluff resident, Fairgrounds rep, or Surfrider Foundation rep) should be included for each STAC member. Allow each STAC member to opt in or out. Vote passed 8-0.**

Motion Brinner that STAC member statements be the only thing in the memo. No second.

6) **Unanimous consensus to delete a statement from the managed retreat memo introduction: "Ensuring the future of both natural resources and public infrastructure through accommodation or relocation was well accepted throughout the STAC process." Vote passed 8-0.**

7) Motion Gaasterland, second Handzel. **Delete portion of the last statement in the second paragraph of the managed retreat memo introduction “- protect, accommodate, retreat-”. Vote passed 7-1 (Brinner voting no).**

8) Motion Gaasterland, second Brinner. Delete statement (third sentence in second paragraph of memo section 10.1) relating to landward migration of the shoreline and what it could mean in North Beach. Motion fails by vote of 2-5-1 with Gaasterland and Brinner voting yes; Fletcher, Crabtree, Imperato, Stoke, Fuller voting no; and Handzel abstaining. Sentence stays in.

9) Motion Crabtree, second Handzel. **To reconsider the highlighted statement (third sentence in second paragraph of memo section 10.1 considered in vote #8) in order to change “would” to “could”. Vote passed 6-1-1 with Gaasterland voting no; Brinner abstaining.**

10) Motion Crabtree, second Handzel. **Add “There is concern that” at the start of the last sentence in the second paragraph of memo section 10.1 and change the existing reference from “would” to “could”. Vote passed 7-0-1 (Brinner abstained).**

11) Motion Crabtree, second Imperato. **Anytime the managed retreat memo refers to “state guidance” it will be replaced with “Coastal Commission guidance”. Vote passed 7-0-1 (Brinner abstained).**

12) Motion Gaasterland, second Handzel. **Unanimous consensus to remove the reference “nearly equally” from managed retreat memo section 10.2. Vote passed 8-0.**

13) Motion Gaasterland, second Imperato. **Unanimous consensus to delete the parenthetical phrase “(both before and after the addition of two additional members from beach level neighborhoods)” from managed retreat memo section 10.2. Vote passed 8-0.**

14) Motion Crabtree, second Imperato. **Unanimous consensus to delete the statement in memo section 10.2 (following the parenthetical phrase that was deleted by vote #13: “Over a two and a half year period, the committee established its position on managed retreat with reliance on tools including the ESA report and much input from regional stakeholders, but with limited input from beach-level residents”). Vote passed 8-0.**

15) Motion Gaasterland, second Handzel. **Delete the last sentence from managed retreat memo section 10.2 “Further, STAC requested the City Council add two additional STAC members from the beach level neighborhoods.” Vote passed 8-0**

16) Motion Gaasterland, second Imperato. **Delete the last sentence from #3 in the managed retreat memo section 10.3. Vote passed 6-1-1 with Brinner voting no and Fuller abstaining.**

17) Motion Crabtree, second Imperato. **Replace “general majority consensus” with “discussion” under memo section 10.3 #7. Vote passed 8-0.**

[STAC member Handzel clarified that Memo section 10.3 refers to the Adaptation Plan Section 2.1 discussion of Coastal Act goals. STAC member Brinner noted per California Public Resources Code section 30007.5, the legislature recognizes conflicts may occur between policies in the Coastal Act and they should be resolved in a manner which on balance is the most protective of significant coastal resources.]

18) Motion Crabtree, second Handzel. **Unanimous consent to delete the highlighted/struck out sentence in memo section 10.4 “They must understand the perspective and decision making criteria that property owners employ to make sense of proposed SLR risk mitigation policies. For a managed retreat policy not to further heighten social, economic, legal and political conflicts,”. Vote passed 8-0.**

STAC member Crabtree confirmed that the reference to 800 parking spaces in her statement in the memo was confirmed as correct by City parking enforcement staff.

19) Motion Gaasterland, second Crabtree. **That the STAC recommend adoption of the Del Mar Adaptation Plan as a result of the revisions incorporated by STAC. Vote passed 8-0.**

20) Motion Gaasterland, second Crabtree. **To adopt the STAC memo on managed retreat as edited to accompany the Adaptation Plan. Vote passed 8-0.**

[STAC member Fuller left the meeting after conclusion of Item 4.]

5. ESA PRESENTATION TO STAC ON PROPOSED APPROACH FOR THE SEDIMENT MANAGEMENT PLAN AND WETLAND HABITAT ASSESSMENT

Lindsey Sheehan, Hydrologist, Environmental Science Associates presented a power point with the proposed methods and approach for the Sediment Management Plan and Lagoon Habitat Evolution Assessment, which are the planning level technical analyses currently in process. [The power point is posted on the City’s web page with the January STAC agenda.]

The Sediment Management Plan will identify how sediment moves through Del Mar (from the river and along the coast) and how sediment transport may change with sea level rise in Del Mar. ESA is collecting the history of beach nourishment and dredging in Del Mar and relying on existing technical studies that are available relating to the littoral cell as a whole. A data gap identified is how sediment that moves in and out of the lagoon could change with sea level rise based on coastal wave forces, the inlet and beach morphology, and lagoon dynamics. The analysis will consider sediment transport along shore and across shore and will take into account existing shoreline protection and the differences sediment transport along areas with bluffs and within the lagoon inlet. They are using geomorphic models for their analysis. The work product will be a report with a long term sediment budget assessment (rates and patterns of deposition and erosion quantities of sand); and recommendations for a channel dredging plan and beach nourishment plan specific to Del Mar’s needs. A report draft should be available in March.

STAC member Stoke requested that ESA factor the City of Carlsbad project in progress to remove a pipeline that runs perpendicular to the beach. Lindsey confirmed that ESA is accounting for all factors that may affect sediment transport in the littoral cell.

At the request of STAC member Handzel, Walt Crampton agreed to provide the City/ESA with his artificial headlands concept as something that could be plugged into the model as a hypothetical.

The Lagoon Habitat Evolution Assessment will identify the habitats in Del Mar that are vulnerable to sea level rise and the potential patterns and locations for habitat to migrate into upstream and upland areas adjacent to the San Dieguito Lagoon. The analysis will look to understand the migration pattern for different habitat types and where the habitats are most likely to establish. ESA will use the SLAMM (Sea Level Affecting Marshes Model) model, which will consider variations in tides.

On February 22, ESA will return to STAC to present their initial findings on these studies.

STAC member Handzel requested the City add to the “wish list” the ability to have ESA test the viability of a living levee as an adaptation strategy.

6. CITY COUNCIL LIAISON COMMENTS

Mayor Worden and Deputy Mayor Druker congratulated STAC on reaching this milestone on the Adaptation Plan and thanked the STAC members for their hard work. If new comments come up as the Adaptation Plan process continues along, they are still welcome. STAC 2.0 is the next role for STAC to provide input on sediment management and STAC’s vision for the beach.

7. COMMITTEE MEMBER UPDATES

STAC member Crabtree requested a presentation on the City’s Beach Preservation Initiative. Mayor Worden volunteered to provide this as an information item on a future agenda. [See Del Mar Municipal Code 30.50 (Beach Overlay Zone) and City Council adopted BPI guidelines.]

8. STAFF UPDATES *None*

9. ORAL COMMUNICATIONS FROM THE PUBLIC (NON-ACTION ITEMS)

Dave Grubb

10. ITEMS FOR FUTURE AGENDA

Next meeting will include ESA’s Initial Findings for the Sediment Management Plan & Lagoon Habitat Migration Studies. Chair Gaasterland requested the information item from Mayor Worden on the Beach Preservation Initiative (BPI) be added to the next STAC agenda.

11. ADJOURNMENT

6:50 pm Motion Crabtree, second Imperato to adjourn to 2/22 meeting. Vote 7-0.